



2017年1月23日监察员给安全理事会主席的信

安全理事会第 2253(2015)号决议附件二第 20(c)段规定，监察员应一年两次向安理会提交报告，概述其活动。依照这一要求，谨随函递交监察员办公室的第十三次报告。本报告介绍监察员办公室自上次报告印发以来，在 2016 年 8 月 1 日至 2017 年 1 月 23 日这一期间开展的活动。

请提请安全理事会成员注意本函和上述报告，并将其作为安理会文件印发为荷。

监察员

凯瑟琳·玛琪-乌海尔(签名)



监察员办公室依照安全理事会第 2253(2015)号决议提交的报告

一. 背景

1. 本报告介绍了自 2016 年 8 月 1 日监察员第十二次报告(S/2016/671)印发以来监察员办公室开展活动的最新情况。

二. 有关除名案件的活动

概述

2. 在本报告所述期间，监察员办公室的主要活动是处理个人和实体提交的除名申请。

除名案件

3. 在本报告所述期间，监察员办公室收到并受理了 8 宗新案，包括再次提出的两份申请。截至 2017 年 1 月 23 日，办公室自设立以来收到的除名申请总数为 78 宗。除非申请人另有请求，所有姓名/名称在审议期间以及在申请被驳回或撤回的情况下保持机密。

4. 自监察员办公室设立以来，监察员已向安全理事会关于伊拉克和黎凡特伊斯兰国(达伊沙)、基地组织及关联个人、团体、企业和实体的第 1267(1999)、第 1989(2011)和第 2253(2015)号决议所设委员会提交了共 68 份综合报告。¹ 在本报告所述期间，监察员提交了 3 份报告，出席委员会会议一次，就一宗案件陈述案情。

5. 自第十二次报告印发以来，已通过监察员程序保留了一人的列名。

6. 监察员办公室自设立以来，通过监察员程序或委员会的单独裁决累计解决了 66 宗案件，其中涉及个人、实体或两者结合向监察员提出的申请。在通过监察员程序全面了结的 64 宗案件中，46 名个人和 28 个实体被除名，1 个实体因系某列名实体的别称而被除名，13 份除名申请被驳回。此外，3 名个人在完成监察员程序前被委员会除名，在提交综合报告后有 1 份申请被撤回。截至 2017 年 1 月 23 日的所有案件状况说明载于本报告附件。

¹ 案件总数包括 2011 年结案的一宗案件，其中，在监察员向委员会提交并介绍其报告后，申请人撤回了除名请求。该数字还包括 2013 年结案的一宗案件，其中，在监察员已向委员会提交报告、但尚未向委员会介绍报告时，委员会决定将申请人除名。案件总数中不包括 2013 年结案的另外两宗案件，其中，委员会在监察员提交报告之前就决定将申请人除名，于是，监察员的案件已无实际意义。

7. 在编写本报告时，监察员有 8 宗待决案件处于收集信息/对话阶段，委员会有 3 项待决案件。本报告所述期间向办公室提交的 4 份申请均由个人提出。迄今为止，在总共 78 宗案件中，70 宗由个人提出，2 宗由个人与 1 个或多个实体共同提出，6 宗由实体单独提出。在 78 宗案件中，38 宗案件的申请人现在或曾经得到法律顾问协助。

从各国收集信息

8. 在 8 宗新案中，迄今向 16 个国家发送了 30 项提供资料的请求。就本报告所述期间向委员会提交的综合报告所涉 3 宗案件而言，国家不对提供资料请求作答的事情发生了 4 次。除了从请求其提供资料的具体对象国收到的答复外，委员会的一些成员也就普遍分发的申请提供了资料。

9. 在本报告所述期间，监察员曾在有关国家首都就具体案件与官员会晤一次，就两宗具体案件直接收集信息。她还分别在三个国家的首都与上述国家当局会晤，讨论与监察员进程有关的更广泛问题。

10. 在本报告所述期间，有一次，监察员依照第 2253(2015)号决议附件二第 3 段的规定，在被征询意见的所有指认国均不反对将申请人除名的情况下，酌情缩短了收集资料的期限。

与申请人对话

11. 在本报告所述期间，监察员及其办公室在待决案件的对话阶段与所有申请人进行了沟通，包括书面文字交流、电话讨论、面谈以及视频交谈。监察员还亲自前往与 3 名申请人面谈。

向有关国家提供综合报告

12. 第 2253(2015)号决议附件二第 13 段规定，监察员在收到请求并获得委员会批准后，可将综合报告副本提供给有关国家(指认国、国籍国、居住国或公司注册国)，同时作出保护机密材料所需的任何改动。在本报告所述期间，监察员收到了有关国家提出的 3 份披露信息请求。委员会批准了所有请求。

查阅保密或机密信息

13. 本报告所述期间，与加拿大达成了获取保密或机密信息的一项新安排。迄今为止，与奥地利达成了一项正式协议，并与澳大利亚、比利时、加拿大、哥斯达黎加、丹麦、芬兰、法国、德国、爱尔兰、列支敦士登、卢森堡、荷兰、新西兰、葡萄牙、瑞士、大不列颠及北爱尔兰联合王国和美利坚合众国达成了 17 项安排。与前任监察员作出的一项安排所用措辞明确表示它是有关国家与前任监察员本人间的安排。监察员与该国进行了接触，但该国尚未确认与前任监察员的该项安排是否依然有效。

14. 在本报告所述期间，已继续努力来扩大安排/协议清单；希望在今后数月内取得进一步进展。一个国家确认愿意签订资料分享协议，监察员与法律事务厅及该国常驻联合国代表团进行互动后，该国当局目前正在拟订最后草案。

三. 有关监察员办公室发展的活动综述

概述

15. 在本报告所述期间，尽可能继续开展了进一步发展和加强监察员办公室的活动。

办公室的外联和宣传工作

16. 鉴于时间和资源的限制，监察员尽可能参加了一些外联活动。

17. 2016年10月16日，监察员作为评论员参加了一本论述法定程序力量的书的首发式；伦敦玛丽王后大学主办了这次活动。² 她特别谈到了监察员工作的程序公正性，谈到该进程如何有助于进一步服务于公共利益。2016年11月7日，监察员参加了政治事务部安全理事会事务司为安全理事会新成员举办的关于制裁和撰写安全理事会报告的就职讨论会。她介绍了监察员办公室的成立背景以及监察员的作用。此外，11月22日，监察员在向会员国公开通报情况时，说明了其办公室所处理案件的最新情况，并讨论了她在工作中对于机密资料的使用。在通报过程中，她还强调：监察员办公室的行政安排几乎没有多大改进，这对该办公室的独立性产生了影响。她还谈到了最近在致函申请者说明原因方面经受挫折，以及它对监察员机制信誉的影响，并表示希望能够迅速回复到较好的工作状态。

18. 在本报告所述期间，监察员继续与欧洲联盟各机构保持接触。她特别同欧洲联盟委员会的代表讨论的问题是，欧洲联盟综合法院在与监察员工作有关的判例方面的最近事态发展。她还会见了欧洲法院的一名法官，³ 同他们讨论了监察员工作的方方面面，包括增加透明度的努力和获取信息的问题。讨论还涉及到公平性方面的关切，起因在于获得不能披露给申请人的机密信息的机会及依靠此种信息的程度，这是欧洲法院和监察员办公室共同关心的领域。⁴

² Devika Hovell, *The Power of Process; the Value of Due Process in Security Council Sanctions Decision-Making*, (Oxford University Press, 2016 年版)。

³ 2016年11月1日，监察员在纽约会晤艾伦·罗萨斯法官。

⁴ 欧盟综合法院和欧洲法院各自的《议事规则》第105条和190条之二于2016年12月25日生效。这些规则为以下各方面提供了框架：从程序上处理涉及欧洲联盟或其成员国安全或其国际关系交往的机密资料或材料，以及不适用由此产生的对抗性原则的例外情形。

与制裁委员会的交流

19. 在本报告所述期间，监察员出席委员会会议一次。2016年8月8日，她介绍了自己的一项报告，其中涉及一宗申请人列名被保留的案件。

20. 与以往一样，监察员及其办公室工作人员继续与协调员和分析支助和制裁监测组成员定期接触。监测组继续根据第 2253(2015)号决议附件二第 4 段的规定，提供相关资料。在本报告所述期间，监测组协助监察员办公室审查德文本或阿拉伯文本的除名请求和辅助材料。监测组还帮助监察员办公室用德文和阿拉伯文与申请人进行沟通。最后，监测组还就有关具体除名请求的问题提供了专家意见。

与国家、政府间组织、联合国机构和非政府组织联络

21. 在本报告所述期间，监察员及其办公室工作人员继续与各国互动，特别是与待决除名申请所涉国家互动。他们与关心监察员办公室工作的国家举行了数次双边会议，讨论若干一般性问题，包括如何增强该办公室的独立性。监察员还就查阅机密或保密信息的协议或安排与一些国家继续举行了讨论。监察员还与非正式的“在定向制裁问题上观点一致国家集团”⁵ 以及欧洲联盟和欧洲联盟委员会代表保持了联系。监察员还在一些国家的首都与这些国家的官员会面，讨论一般问题，并了解有关具体案件的信息。

工作方法和研究

22. 与以前一样，本报告所述期间开展的个案工作利用了开放源码进行调查，以收集与除名请求有关的资料。

23. 监察员继续关注相关国家和地区法律案件的发展，并收集相关信息，包括欧洲联盟综合法院就“穆罕默德·格布拉诉欧盟委员会”案作出判决。⁶ 关于该判决的情况，详见下文“监察员办公室的作用”一节。

网站

24. 监察员办公室网站(www.un.org/sc/suborg/en/ombudsperson)继续得到修订和更新。

⁵ 由奥地利、比利时、哥斯达黎加、丹麦、德国、芬兰、列支敦士登、荷兰、挪威、瑞典和瑞士组成。

⁶ 综合法院(第三分庭)判决，T-248/13 号案：“穆罕默德·格布拉诉欧盟委员会”(2016年12月13日)，见 <http://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/TXT/PDF/?uri=CELEX:62013TJ0248&from=EN>。此案最初源于制裁委员会在2006年12月12日将穆罕默德·格布拉(“申请人”)姓名列入制裁名单，及此后在2007年1月10日被列入欧洲联盟的名单。申请者在欧洲联盟机构两次提起诉讼：(1) 请求欧洲联盟委员会就将他的名字列入欧洲联盟名单进行复审；(2) 在制裁委员会2013年3月6日作出在名单上保留他的名字的决定后，要求撤销(a) 欧盟委员会第14/2007号条例中涉及他的内容，以及(b) 欧盟委员会确认他在欧洲联盟名单上列名的2013年3月6日 Ares(2013)188023 号决定。

四. 意见和结论

程序的公平性和透明度

与申诉者的接触机会

25. 在本报告所述期间，委员会就一项除名的申诉所作的决定完全依据了监察员收集的资料，并采纳了她的建议。

26. 在本报告所述期间，监察员无法往访在监狱的两位申请人，因为他们的居住国未及时提供入境签证。监察员可以确信，这一情况并不妨碍申请人在其案例的特定情况下所得到待遇的公平性。在第一个案例中，监察员计划于 2017 年 1 月初前往当地与当局会晤，并访问申请人。然而，她于 2016 年 11 月从秘书处获悉，由于她的合同属于咨询性质，秘书处不能及时延长其合同以批准她 1 月初的旅行。为了避免对申请人造成不应有的拖延，并为了节省费用，监察员她决定提前就此案计划的旅行，以便将这一旅行与其他旅行相结合。当明确了解到有关当局不能及时签发入境签证时，监察员在一个联合国机构的帮助下安排了一次与申请人的视频会晤。能够采用这一方式完全是因为本案的申请人不需要口译服务。尽管如此，监察员已要求与相关常驻联合国代表团大使见面，以便探索如何避免以后再次发生这类情况，并希望能尽早进行这次商讨。

27. 关于第二个案例，监察员提前一个月通知了相关国家的常驻代表团她有计划访问该国主管当局，⁷ 并在该国与申请人面谈。然而，该代表团无法提供签证，因为代表团没有从本国首都获得核准访问的函件。监察员起初将她的旅行推迟了一个星期，以便让该国有更多的时间签发签证，其时她仍然能够将这次访问与先前已安排的旅行相结合。不过，对此案所收集的资料数量很有限，据此作面对面访谈的需要也不大。此外，由于申请人需要口译服务，他就不能通过视频会晤接受访谈。因此，监察员最终选择书面对话——尽管这不是理想的方式，并认为这并不影响审理这一特定案例的程序的总体公平性。监察员随后会见了相关国家的常驻代表，后者向她保证，在获得有关此案的有用的信息时将会向她提供信息。观察员可以确信，现已设定了适当程序以避免今后发生类似的情况。

说明理由的信件

28. 在本报告所述期间，委员会完全中止了以前积极的做法，即在其说明理由的信件中纳入监察员提供的大段书面分析内容，从而使这类信件提供日益实质性的

⁷ 国籍国兼居住国未对监察员索取信息的请求作出回复，也没有要求更多的时间以作出回复。

理由。⁸ 有鉴于这些函件对程序的透明度和总体的公正性(及对这方面的看法)具有重要意义, 委员会若能维持这一先前的既定惯例应是有益的。

29. 监察员了解, 在委员会审议了监察员的建议之后, 对于提供拘押的理由和结束制裁的理由这一要求应得到遵守的程度存在着意见的分歧。⁹ 有一种意见认为, 只要说明委员会已经听取了监察员关于考虑从名单上除名、或将人名保持在名单上的建议, 这就符合了提供理由的要求。监察员认为, 这种诠释与这项要求本身的意图相悖。委员会在遵循监察员的建议时并不提供其本身的理由, 而是提出载于综合报告中的一个摘要, 对此并明确指出, 这些理由并非委员会全体或委员会任何个人所提出。如要在这一摘要中充分反映所述理由, 就必须对申请人的论点有起码的陈述, 并充分反映监察员综合报告中所载的分析。第十一次和第十二次报告显示, 监察员履行任务的第一年中, 委员会的惯例表明了这样做是可能的。

30. 监察员强烈希望这一积极的趋势能在下一个报告期间恢复。委员会在向申请人转递广泛的理由过程中保持一致性和可靠性是一个重大步骤, 可使这一过程更加透明和公平的。这方面的任何倒退不仅会威胁到特定案例申请人的公正性, 而且也将影响到监察员机制的总体公信力。正当区域和国家法院对于这一机制的看法开始转好之时出现这种倒退也是一种讽刺。最后, 大篇幅转载理由说明的做法有益于鼓励和引导某些申请人开始脱离进程(见下文)。

31. 一些申请人否认最初导致他们被列入名单的信息是正确的, 也有人否认监察员在收集资料阶段获得的信息是正确的。其他申请人声称, 这类信息并没有显示他们与伊拉克和黎凡特伊斯兰国(达伊沙)或基地组织有联系。然而, 某些申请人承认他们确实曾有过这种关系。这些申请人要求从名单上除名, 理由是他们已经与那些实体切断了联系, 与之不再有关联。¹⁰ 对于这类申请人, 监察员机制内涵中的人性化层面或许是最有实际意义的。这人性化的一面可以有补于这些申请人的脱离关系进程。脱离关系不是一个顷刻间发生的过程。在一些案例中, 申请人需要得到支持和指导。申请人不可否认地认为监察员具有一定的权威。¹¹ 监察员依据这种权威、并依据她在对话阶段能接触申请人的独特机会, 得以在其分析中纳入承认申请人在脱离关系的过程中所作努力的信息。如有必要, 她也可以指导申请人采取充分完成这一进程的进一步必要步骤。

⁸ 监察员办公室第十一次报告(见第 41 段)和第十二次报告(见第 30 段)对拘押和从名单上除名这两类案例中的这一趋势作了详述。

⁹ 这项要求见诸于第 2253(2015)号决议附件二。

¹⁰ 申请人的这一论点可以为支撑最初的除名申诉中、也可以在重复的出名申诉中提出。见监察员分析、评估和使用信息的方法第 4.1.1 条。可参看 www.un.org/sc/suborg/en/ombudsperson/assessment-information。

¹¹ 监察员的任务是由安全理事会确定的。监察员由秘书长任命, 委员会迄今始终采纳了监察员的建议。

32. 对于被委员会列名的申请人而言，在因其与列名原因相同或类似的行为而受审讯和定罪之后或同时，这类指导尤其重要。对于一些此类案例，脱离关系的过程是在申请人服刑起开始的。监察员可以根据自受指控的活动发生以来所过去的时间来推断脱离联系的情况，特别是如果这段时间并非短暂。但是，如果申请人被监禁，他或她继续参与支助被列名实体的活动的的能力就受到限制。¹² 在这种情况下，如果申请人已经获释，监察员就须寻找申请人在受拘押期间或其后阶段是否有脱离关系的具体线索。各种脱离关系的迹象甚至在申请人被拘押期间也可以观察到，其中包括真心诚意地参与消除激进化的过程；为避免与激进份子接触和/或阻止后者的接近而作的努力；以及接受对过去行为的责任，即使在审判时否认了这种责任。

33. 监察员的综合报告可对申请人为脱离关系所作努力的承认，并对这种努力给予具体鼓励和/或提供关于如何脱离的指导。委员会在向申请人传达关于委员会作出将从制裁名单上除名和保留在名单上的决定的理由时，不能遗漏这项内容，这很重要。这方面的内容对于负责惩处某些申请人的拘押当局和缓刑监督官可能会有实用价值。

拖延向拘押中的申请人发通知

34. 监察员重申第十、十一和十二次报告的建议，即应解决不将保持列名之事及时通知申请人的问题。¹³ 出于在这些报告中说明的理由，监察员建议，如果决定将人员保持在名单上，就应在作出保留在名单上的决定之后允许她立即将这一决定通知申请人，通知的同时并提供一份说明，告知将在 60 天的期限内提供此决定的理由。

与国家的合作/国家对监察员办公室的支持

35. 总体上支持监察员办公室的国家在报告所述期间继续表现出这种支持。由于一些国家未能在上述期间对索取信息的要求作出回复，监察员在与这些国家的交往中及在向会员国一般地介绍情况过程中重申了作出这些回复对于除名过程的重要性。即使一些国家不能根据某一具体的要求分享有关信息，这类回复仍然很重要。

监察员办公室的独立性

36. 第十二次报告阐述了安全理事会事务司在 2016 年 6 月 17 日委员会非正式会议上根据第 2253(2015)号决议第 59 段制定并介绍的各种备选方案。¹⁴ 监察员认

¹² 见监察员分析、评估和使用信息的方法第 4.1.3 条。可参看 www.un.org/sc/suborg/en/ombudsperson/assessment-information。

¹³ 见 S/2015/533 号文件第 47 段、S/2016/96 号文件第 42 段和 S/2016/671 号文件第 31 段。

¹⁴ 在第 2253(2015)号决议第 59 段中，安全理事会请秘书长继续加强监察员办公室的能力，并作出必要的安排，以确保它能够继续独立、有效和及时地执行任务，并在 6 个月后就采取的行动向委员会提供最新报告。

为，这些备选方案为弥补监察员办公室现状中的不足提供了坚实的基础，并提出以适当的合同安排来保障该办公室的独立性。¹⁵ 然而，监察员在报告期间获悉，委员会对于在上述备选方案基础上采取行动无法达成一致。有鉴于委员会的协商一致达成决定的规则(关于除名请求是否有理由的决定不在此列)，这种情况并不意外。然而，由于这些安排对于监察官办公室的公信力而言十分重要，这种情况依然令人遗憾。11月4日，委员会向秘书处指出了安全理事会事务司在上述非正式会议上指出的论点、即它或可探讨通过某些非正式安排以解决关于监察员办公室的部分关切问题。12月27日，秘书处通知委员会，以下四个非正式措施已经到位：

(a) 在对监察员办公室提供助理服务的工作人员实行考绩的过程中应参考监察员的意见；

(b) 对支助该办公室的工作人员的所有征聘程序都应让监察员参加，其意见应得到考虑；

(c) 监察员应有机会查阅与办公室工作关于的所有材料(包括电子驱动器)；

(d) 监察员应对监察员办公室的网站具有完全的编辑控制。¹⁶

37. 监察员欢迎采取这些非正式的安排，这将加强该办公室的独立性。监察员得到聘用时所遵循的咨询合同和服务条件并不一定体现出这一职能的重要性，而这些安排恰当地解决了这一合同地位对监察员办公室的独立性造成的几乎所有后果。¹⁷ 然而，缺乏一个有自身预算的独立的办公室这种情况无法以非正式安排的方式得以解决。¹⁸ 尽管如此，监察员希望秘书处能在达成的咨询合同中所包含的服务证明书的要求方面取得更大的进展，这一证明涵盖业绩和出勤两个方面，并被认为根本上并不符合独立监察员的角色和职能。¹⁹ 监察员受到鼓舞的是，秘书处已表示，如有可能，它将遵循联合国组织的细则和条例，继续就秘书处和监察员查明的一些问题探索其他非正式的模式，并将随时向委员会作相应的通知。²⁰

监察员办公室的作用

38. 如上文所述，欧洲联盟综合法院对穆罕默德·格布拉诉欧盟委员会一案的判决包含了一个有意思的论点，即监察员是该案申请人可以利用的一项法律补救措施。⁶ 特别是，在确定申请人的撤销列名要求是否有理由依据时，综合法院考虑

¹⁵ 见 S/2016/671 号文件第 35-36 段。

¹⁶ S/AC.37/2016/NOTE.214。

¹⁷ 这些安排粗略地确定了各种惯例，在前任和现任监察员的任职期间受到不均衡的实施。

¹⁸ 目前的预算属于监测小组的特别政治任务项下。

¹⁹ 见 S/2015/533 号文件第 61 段。

²⁰ S/AC.37/2016/NOTE.214。

到了申请人决定不利用这一补救办法。此外，法院同意，欧盟委员会对此案采用了与监察员相同的审查标准。法院在回复联合王国提出的论点²¹时认定，不通过监察员提交除名请求是没有正当理由的，特别是因为申请人声称他有将他的姓名从制裁委员会名单中除去的理由依据。法院还认定，有鉴于所审查的资料和证据，申请人的行为²²无助于减轻对他的合情合理的怀疑。法院对申请人就信息来源提出的论点作出回复，认为欧盟委员会正确地采用了与监察员采用的相同的标准，即首先力图确定关于酷刑的指控是否具有‘充分的资料以提供合理和可信的依据’。²³

39. 申请人不利用这一补救办法并不影响其向综合法院提出的申诉是否可受理。²⁴然而，鉴于法院可能因为未用这种补救而得出不利的推论，这一判决可能会促使希望从清单上除名的个人和实体首先设法通过监察员程序除名，然后才向综合法院要求撤销列名，或至少同时进行这两项程序。

40. 这一判决反映了对监察员机制增值效应的一种积极评估。判决依循了联合国最高法院的另一项判决²⁵以及欧洲人权法院的一项法官的另外意见，²⁶两者都是在2016年上半年发布的，而且两者都对监察员审议进程表现出新的兴趣。这些意见令人鼓舞，也与以前在建立了监察员办公室后区域法院的一些判决所表

²¹ 委员会在审查将他的名字列入欧洲联盟清单决定的过程中，曾多次告知申请人：他以向联合国监察员提出从制裁委员会名单中除名的请求。

²² 申请人的行为系指他未能通过监察员进程提出关于除名的请求，以及他撤回了向法院提出的申诉。

²³ 这一结论是鉴于申请人申诉委员会没有考虑制裁委员会对他提出的指控是否依据了经严刑逼供获得的资料。综合法院裁定，委员会正确地裁定，在本案的情况下，总体地推定制裁委员会在裁决中并不以酷刑取得的证据为依据是合理的。

²⁴ 即使个人或实体经监察员的建议成功地从名单上除名，此个人或实体仍然可以转向欧洲联盟法院以决定其最初是否应被列入名单。

²⁵ 联合王国的最高法院对 Youssef 诉外交和联邦事务大臣的案件(2016年1月27日)。在该案中，根据监察员的建议被保留在制裁名单上的申请人经上诉所质疑的是国家内部对制裁的执行。联合国最高法院驳回 Youssef 先生的上诉时不仅依据了对列入名单决定所罗列的理由，这些理由已经在委员会决定将 Youssef 先生保留在名单上之后在其网站上公布了。最高法院还提到了信函中所载的一些资料，其中说明了监察员提供的理由和分析思路。

²⁶ Pinto de Albuquerque 法官对欧洲人权法院大分庭对 Al-Dulimi 和 Montana 管理公司诉瑞士案宣布的裁决，第 5809/08 号申请(2016年6月21日)提出的同意意见，获得 Hayiyev、Pechal 和 Debov 法官的赞同。在本案中，持一致意见的法官认为“原则上，联合国机构在对个人和实体实施制裁作出具有约束力的决定时，没有任何情况可以阻止这些机构根据《联合国宪章》和《公民权利和政治权利国际公约》本身采取适当的实质性和程序性保障措施。法官们表示监察员办公室非为无足轻重，这表明在系统内循序渐进是可能的。如果有这样的政治意愿，并指出该办公室可以得到进一步的加强”。

达的观点形成对照。这些判决几乎并不注意这一办公室的设立，因为该办公室不对有效的司法保护提供保障。²⁷

结论

41. 在本报告所述期间，在说明理由信件这一环节上，监察员程序的透明度和公平性不幸受到损害。委员会在这方面很值得恢复以前的做法。与秘书处向委员会提出的关于建立独立监察员办公室并保障其独立性的备选方案相比，秘书处作出的非正式安排不那么全面或那么令人满意。然而，在委员会内关于对这些问题制定一个更正式和全面的解决办法未达成一致意见的情况下，这些安排适当地解决了监察员对此提出的大部分关切。在这两个领域取得更大的进展对于监察员机制的公信力以及对遵循独立性和公正性的基本要求(包括恰当的透明度)而言很重要，而安全理事会已就此表示了承诺。鉴于区域和国家法院对监察员机制的看法开始转好，在这方面取得进展就更加重要。

²⁷ 例如，见欧洲联盟法院大法庭关于欧盟委员会及他人诉 Kadi 案(C-584/10P、C-593/10P 和 C-595/10P 的合并案件)(2013 年 7 月 18 日)的判决，其中法院指出，在联合国层面有些的司法保护得不到保障的情况下，欧洲联盟法院的有效审查更加重要；另见欧洲人权法院关于 Nada 诉瑞士案的判决，第 10593/08 号申请(2012 年 9 月 12 日)。

Annex

Status of cases

Case 1, one individual (Status: denied)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
28 July 2010	Transmission of case 1 to the Committee
28 February 2011	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
10 May 2011	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
14 June 2011	Committee decision
1 September 2011	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 2, Safet Ekrem Durguti (Status: delisted)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
30 September 2010	Transmission of case 2 to the Committee
26 April 2011	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
31 May 2011	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
14 June 2011	Committee decision to delist
12 August 2011	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 3, one entity (Status: delisting request withdrawn by petitioner)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
3 November 2010	Transmission of case 3 to the Committee
14 June 2011	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
26 July 2011	Presentation of Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
2 August 2011	Withdrawal of petition

Case 4, Shafiq Ben Mohamed Ben Mohammed Al Ayadi (Status: delisted)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
6 December 2010	Transmission of case 4 to the Committee
29 June 2011	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
26 July 2011	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
17 October 2011	Committee decision to delist
8 November 2011	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 5, Tarek Ben Al-Bechir Ben Amara Al-Charaabi (Status: delisted)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
30 December 2010	Transmission of case 5 to the Committee
26 April 2011	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
31 May 2011	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
14 June 2011	Committee decision to delist
12 August 2011	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 6, Abdul Latif Saleh (Status: delisted)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
14 January 2011	Transmission of case 6 to the Committee
17 June 2011	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
26 July 2011	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
19 August 2011	Committee decision to delist
8 November 2011	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 7, Abu Sufian Al-Salamabi Muhammed Ahmed Abd Al-Razziq (Status: delisted)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
28 January 2011	Transmission of case 7 to the Committee
29 August 2011	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
15 November 2011	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
30 November 2011	Committee decision to delist
13 February 2012	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 8, Ahmed Ali Nur Jim'ale and 23 entities^a (Status: delisted)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
17 March 2011	Transmission of case 8 to the Committee
23 September 2011	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
13 December 2011	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
27 December 2011	Committee decision to delist six entities
21 February 2012	Committee decision to delist one individual and 17 entities
8 June 2012	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

^a Barakaat North America, Inc., Barakat Computer Consulting, Barakat Consulting Group, Barakat Global Telephone Company, Barakat Post Express, Barakat Refreshment Company, Al Baraka Exchange, LLC, Barakaat Telecommunications Co. Somalia, Ltd., Barakaat Bank of Somalia, Barako Trading Company, LLC, Al-Barakaat, Al-Barakaat Bank, Al-Barakaat Bank of Somalia, Al-Barakat Finance Group, Al-Barakat Financial Holding Co., Al-Barakat Global Telecommunications, Al-Barakat Group of Companies Somalia Limited, Al-Barakat International, Al-Barakat Investments, Barakaat Group of Companies, Barakaat Red Sea Telecommunications, Barakat International Companies and Barakat Telecommunications Company Limited.

Case 9, Saad Rashed Mohammed Al-Faqih and Movement for Reform in Arabia (Status: delisted)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
19 April 2011	Transmission of case 9 to the Committee
21 February 2012	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
17 April 2012	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
1 July 2012	Committee decision to delist
13 November 2012	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 10, Ibrahim Abdul Salam Mohamed Boyasseer (Status: delisted)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
6 May 2011	Transmission of case 10 to the Committee
9 January 2012	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
1 March 2012	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
8 May 2012	Committee decision to delist

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
3 August 2012	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 11, Mondher ben Mohsen ben Ali al-Baazaoui (Status: delisted)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
1 June 2011	Transmission of case 11 to the Committee
19 January 2012	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
1 March 2012	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
30 March 2012	Committee decision to delist
10 July 2012	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 12, Kamal ben Mohamed ben Ahmed Darraji (Status: delisted)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
30 June 2011	Transmission of case 12 to the Committee
28 February 2012	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
3 April 2012	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
4 May 2012	Committee decision to delist
3 August 2012	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 13, Fondation Secours Mondial (Status: amended^b)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
7 July 2011	Transmission of case 13 to the Committee
14 December 2011	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
24 January 2012	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
17 February 2012	Committee decision to amend
9 July 2012	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

^b Amended to be removed as an alias of Global Relief Foundation (QE.G.91.02.).

Case 14, Sa'd Abdullah Hussein al-Sharif (Status: delisted)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
20 July 2011	Transmission of case 14 to the Committee
29 February 2012	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
3 April 2012	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
27 April 2012	Committee decision to delist
5 June 2012	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 15, Fethi ben al-Rebei Absha Mnasri (Status: delisted)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
4 August 2011	Transmission of case 15 to the Committee
9 March 2012	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
17 April 2012	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
2 May 2012	Committee decision to delist
3 August 2012	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 16, Mounir Ben Habib Ben al-Taher Jarraya (Status: delisted)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
15 August 2011	Transmission of case 16 to the Committee
9 March 2012	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
17 April 2012	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
2 May 2012	Committee decision to delist
3 August 2012	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 17, Rachid Fettar (Status: delisted)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
26 September 2011	Transmission of case 17 to the Committee
27 April 2012	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
5 June 2012	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
20 June 2012	Committee decision to delist
19 December 2012	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 18, Ali Mohamed El Heit (Status: delisted)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
5 October 2011	Transmission of case 18 to the Committee
2 May 2012	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
3 July 2012	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
19 July 2012	Committee decision to delist
19 December 2012	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 19, Yassin Abdullah Kadi (listed as Yasin Abdullah Ezzedine Qadi) (Status: delisted)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
16 November 2011	Transmission of case 19 to the Committee
11 July 2012	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
10 September 2012	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
5 October 2012	Committee decision to delist
25 August 2014	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 20, Chabaane ben Mohamed ben Mohamed al-Trabelsi (Status: delisted)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
21 November 2011	Transmission of case 20 to the Committee
23 April 2012	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
5 June 2012	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
20 June 2012	Committee decision to delist
19 December 2012	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 21, Adel Abdul Jalil Ibrahim Batterjee (Status: delisted)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
3 January 2012	Transmission of case 21 to the Committee
30 August 2012	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
6 November 2012	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
14 January 2013	Committee decision to delist
5 September 2013	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 22, Ibrahim ben Hedhili ben Mohamed al-Hamami (Status: delisted)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
6 February 2012	Transmission of case 22 to the Committee
25 September 2012	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
6 November 2012	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
21 November 2012	Committee decision to delist
7 February 2013	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 23, Suliman Hamd Suleiman Al-Buthe (Status: delisted) (Repeated request)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
23 February 2012	Transmission of case 23 to the Committee
9 October 2012	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
27 November 2012	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
10 February 2013	Committee decision to delist
30 August 2013	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 24, Mamoun Darkazanli (Status: delisted)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
28 February 2012	Transmission of case 24 to the Committee
12 November 2012	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
8 January 2013	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
	Ombudsperson to the Committee
11 March 2013	Committee decision to delist
30 August 2013	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 25, Abdullahi Hussein Kahie (Status: delisted)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
28 February 2012	Transmission of case 25 to the Committee
26 July 2012	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
10 September 2012	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
26 September 2012	Committee decision to delist
19 December 2012	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 26, Usama Muhammed Awad Bin Laden (Status: delisted)

Ombudsperson case became moot following the Committee's decision of 21 February 2013

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
23 April 2012	Transmission of case 26 to the Committee
15 February 2013	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
21 February 2013	Committee decision to delist

Case 27, one individual (Status: denied)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
7 May 2012	Transmission of case 27 to the Committee
11 February 2013	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
7 May 2013	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
7 May 2013	Committee decision to retain listing
12 June 2013	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 28, one individual (Status: denied)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
7 June 2012	Transmission of case 28 to the Committee
20 November 2012	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
8 January 2013	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
8 January 2013	Committee decision to retain listing
29 January 2013	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 29, Muhammad ‘Abdallah Salih Sughayr (Status: delisted)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
25 July 2012	Transmission of case 29 to the Committee
9 April 2013	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
21 May 2013	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
20 July 2013	Committee decision to delist
25 August 2014	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 30, Lajnat Al Daawa Al Islamiya (LDI) (Status: delisted)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
25 July 2012	Transmission of case 30 to the Committee
15 April 2013	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
2 July 2013	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
3 September 2013	Committee decision to delist
25 August 2014	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 31, Abd al Hamid Sulaiman Muhammed al-Mujil (Status: delisted)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
1 August 2012	Transmission of case 31 to the Committee
13 March 2013	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
30 April 2013	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
30 June 2013	Committee decision to delist
25 August 2014	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 32, Mohamed ben Mohamed ben Khalifa Abdelhedi (Status: delisted)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
19 September 2012	Transmission of case 32 to the Committee
5 March 2013	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
16 April 2013	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
1 May 2013	Committee decision to delist

Case 33, Mohammed Daki (Status: delisted)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
12 October 2012	Transmission of case 33 to the Committee
28 May 2013	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
30 July 2013	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
16 August 2013	Committee decision to delist
25 August 2014	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 34, Abdelghani Mzoudi (Status: delisted)

Ombudsperson case became moot following the Committee's decision of 18 March 2013

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
8 November 2012	Transmission of case 34 to the Committee
18 March 2013	Committee decision to delist

**Case 35, International Islamic Relief Organization, Philippines, Branch Offices
(Status: delisted)**

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
13 December 2012	Transmission of case 35 to the Committee
5 September 2013	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
1 November 2013	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
3 January 2014	Committee decision to delist
25 August 2014	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

**Case 36, International Islamic Relief Organization, Indonesia, Branch Offices
(Status: delisted)**

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
13 December 2012	Transmission of case 36 to the Committee
5 September 2013	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
1 November 2013	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
3 January 2014	Committee decision to delist
25 August 2014	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 37, Jaber Abdullah Jaber Ahmed Al-Jalahmah (Status: delisted)^c

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
4 February 2013	Transmission of case 37 to the Committee
5 September 2013	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
1 November 2013	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
3 January 2014	Committee decision to delist
25 August 2014	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

^c Jaber Abdullah Jaber Ahmed Al-Jalahmah was re-listed on the same date by a separate Committee decision.

Case 38, Moustafa Abbas (listed as Moustafa Abbas) (Status: delisted)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
13 February 2013	Transmission of case 38 to the Committee
12 August 2013	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
13 September 2013	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
30 September 2013	Committee decision to delist
25 August 2014	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 39, Atilla Selek (Status: delisted)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
13 February 2013	Transmission of case 39 to the Committee
2 October 2013	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
13 December 2013	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
31 December 2013	Committee decision to delist
25 August 2014	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 40, Youssef ben Abdul Baki Ben Youcef Abdaoui (Status: delisted)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
4 March 2013	Transmission of case 40 to the Committee
14 November 2013	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
11 February 2014	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
14 April 2014	Committee decision to delist
25 August 2014	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 41, L'hadi Bendebka (listed as Abdelhadi Ben Debka) (Status: delisted)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
12 March 2013	Transmission of case 41 to the Committee
14 October 2013	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
3 December 2013	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
18 December 2013	Committee decision to delist

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
25 August 2014	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 42, Youcef Abbas (listed as Youcef Abbes (Status: delisted))

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
4 March 2013	Transmission of case 42 to the Committee
2 October 2013	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
15 November 2013	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
3 December 2013	Committee decision to delist
25 August 2014	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 43, Said Yousef AbouAziz (listed as Said Youssef Ali Abu Aziza) (Status: delisted)

Ombudsperson case became moot following the Committee's decision of 26 August 2013

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
27 March 2013	Transmission of case 43 to the Committee
26 August 2013	Committee decision to delist

Case 44, one individual (Status: denied)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
2 May 2013	Transmission of case 44 to the Committee
4 February 2014	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
21 April 2014	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
21 April 2014	Committee decision to retain listing
30 July 2014	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 45, one individual (Status: denied)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
6 May 2013	Transmission of case 45 to the Committee
9 December 2013	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
11 February 2014	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
11 February 2014	Ombudsperson to the Committee Committee decision to retain listing
17 March 2014	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 46, Yacine Ahmed Nacer (Status: delisted)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
10 May 2013	Transmission of case 46 to the Committee
30 December 2013	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
25 February 2014	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
13 March 2014	Committee decision to delist
25 August 2014	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 47, Nabil Benatia (listed as Nabil ben Mohamed ben Ali ben Attia) (Status: delisted)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
3 June 2013	Transmission of case 47 to the Committee
12 November 2013	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
13 December 2013	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
31 December 2013	Committee decision to delist
25 August 2014	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 48, Wael Hamzah Jelaidan (listed as Wa'el Hamza Abd al-Fatah Julaidan) (Status: delisted)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
17 June 2013	Transmission of case 48 to the Committee
19 March 2014	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
24 June 2014	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
25 August 2014	Committee decision to delist
29 October 2014	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 49, one individual (Status: denied)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
24 June 2013	Transmission of case 49 to the Committee
4 April 2014	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
24 June 2014	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
24 June 2014	Committee decision to retain listing
10 September 2014	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 50, Al-Haramain Foundation (USA) (Status: delisted)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
5 September 2013	Transmission of case 50 to the Committee
30 June 2014	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
26 August 2014	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
25 October 2014	Committee decision to delist
29 December 2014	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 51, Aqeel Abdulaziz Aqeel Al-Aqeel (Status: delisted)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
28 October 2013	Transmission of case 51 to the Committee
18 August 2014	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
31 October 2014	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
2 January 2015	Committee decision to delist
3 March 2015	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 52, one individual (Status: denied)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
27 May 2014	Transmission of case 52 to the Committee
18 February 2015	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
14 April 2015	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
14 April 2015	Committee decision to retain listing
10 June 2015	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 53, Abd al-Rahman Muhammad Jaffar 'Ali (Status: delisted)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
13 June 2014	Transmission of case 53 to the Committee
9 December 2014	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
29 January 2015	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
31 March 2015	Committee decision to delist
12 May 2015	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 54, Abdul Rahim Hammad Ahmad al-Talhi (Status: delisted)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
19 June 2014	Transmission of case 54 to the Committee
29 January 2015	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
17 March 2015	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
17 May 2015	Committee decision to delist
22 July 2015	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 55, Ismail Mohamed Ismail Abu Shaweesh (Status: delisted)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
23 June 2014	Transmission of case 55 to the Committee
10 November 2014	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
16 December 2014	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
2 January 2015	Committee decision to delist
17 February 2015	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 56, one individual (Status: denied) (Repeated request)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
5 September 2014	Transmission of case 56 to the Committee
21 April 2015	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
19 June 2015	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
19 June 2015	Committee decision to retain listing
10 July 2015	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 57, one individual (Status: denied) (Repeated request)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
9 September 2014	Transmission of case 57 to the Committee
8 June 2015	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
27 July 2015	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
27 July 2015	Committee decision to retain listing
20 August 2015	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 58, one individual (Status: denied)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
30 August 2014	Transmission of case 58 to the Committee
29 June 2015	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
24 August 2015	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
24 August 2015	Committee decision to retain listing
30 October 2015	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 59, Al Sayyid Ahmed Fathi Hussein Eliwah (Status: delisted)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
30 September 2014	Transmission of case 59 to the Committee
12 May 2015	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
19 June 2015	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
18 August 2015	Committee decision to delist
2 September 2015	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 60, Mohammed Ahmed Shawki al Islambolly (Status: delisted)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
10 November 2014	Transmission of case 60 to the Committee
13 July 2015	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
24 August 2015	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
	Committee decision to delist

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
26 October 2015	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons
27 October 2015	

Case 61, Yasser Mohamed Ismail Abu Shaweesh (Status: delisted)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
19 January 2015	Transmission of case 61 to the Committee
7 July 2015	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
24 August 2015	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
9 September 2015	Committee decision to delist
6 November 2015	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 62, Abd al Wahab Abd al Hafiz (Status: delisted)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
11 March 2015	Transmission of case 62 to the Committee
9 November 2015	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
23 December 2015	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
11 January 2016	Committee decision to delist
22 January 2016	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 63, one individual (Status: denied)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
12 March 2015	Transmission of case 63 to the Committee
10 November 2015	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
23 December 2015	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
23 December 2015	Committee decision to retain listing
12 January 2016	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 64, one individual (Status: denied)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
29 May 2015	Transmission of case 64 to the Committee
25 February 2016	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
20 April 2016	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
20 April 2016	Committee decision to retain listing
9 June 2016	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 65, Farid Aider (Status: delisted)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
27 August 2015	Transmission of case 65 to the Committee
26 February 2016	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
20 April 2016	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
20 June 2016	Committee decision to delist
20 June 2016	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 66, one individual (Status: denied)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
15 October 2015	Transmission of case 66 to the Committee
15 June 2016	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
8 August 2016	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
8 August 2016	Committee decision to retain listing
23 September 2016	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 67, Daniel Martin Schneider (Status: delisted)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
3 February 2016	Transmission of case 67 to the Committee
29 April 2016	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee
17 June 2016	Presentation of the Comprehensive Report by the Ombudsperson to the Committee
5 July 2016	Committee decision to delist
22 August 2016	Formal notification to petitioner with reasons

Case 68, one individual (Status: Committee phase)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
22 March 2016	Transmission of case 68 to the Committee
23 November 2016	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee

Case 69, one individual (Status: Committee phase)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
8 June 2016	Transmission of case 69 to the Committee
30 December 2016	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee

Case 70, one individual (Status: Committee phase)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
12 July 2016	Transmission of case 70 to the Committee
16 January 2017	Comprehensive report submitted to the Committee

Case 71, one individual (Status: Dialogue phase)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
3 August 2016	Transmission of case 71 to the Committee
6 February 2017	Deadline for completion of the Dialogue phase

Case 72, one individual (Status: Dialogue phase)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
9 September 2016	Transmission of case 72 to the Committee
9 March 2017	Deadline for completion of the Dialogue phase

Case 73, one individual (Status: Dialogue phase)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
23 September 2016	Transmission of case 73 to the Committee
23 March 2017	Deadline for completion of the Dialogue phase

Case 74, one individual (Status: Information-gathering phase)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
17 October 2016	Transmission of case 74 to the Committee
17 February 2017	Deadline for completion of the Information-gathering phase

Case 75, one individual (Status: Information-gathering phase)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
17 November 2016	Transmission of case 75 to the Committee
17 March 2017	Deadline for completion of the Information-gathering phase

Case 76, one individual (Status: Information-gathering phase)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
22 November 2016	Transmission of case 76 to the Committee
22 March 2017	Deadline for completion of the Information-gathering phase

Case 77, one individual (Status: Information-gathering phase)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
28 November 2016	Transmission of case 77 to the Committee
28 March 2017	Deadline for completion of the Information-gathering phase

Case 78, one individual (Status: Information-gathering phase)

<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
7 December 2016	Transmission of case 78 to the Committee
7 April 2017	Deadline for completion of the Information-gathering phase
