



General Assembly

Distr.: General
1 December 2015

Original: English

Human Rights Council Working Group on Enforced or Involuntary Disappearances

Communications and cases examined, observations made and other activities conducted at the 107th session (14-18 September 2015)

Report of the Working Group on Enforced or Involuntary Disappearances

I. Introduction

1. The present document reflects the communications and cases examined, the observations made and other activities carried out by the Working Group on Enforced or Involuntary Disappearances at its 107th session, held in Geneva from 14 to 18 September 2015.

II. Communications

2. Between its 106th and 107th sessions, the Working Group transmitted 66 cases under its urgent action procedure, to Bangladesh (1), China (3), Egypt (19), Kenya (1), Pakistan (39), the Sudan (1), the Syrian Arab Republic (1) and the United Arab Emirates (1).

3. At its 107th session, the Working Group decided to transmit 87 newly reported cases of enforced disappearance to 12 States. The Working Group also clarified 29 cases, in Bahrain (1), China (3), Egypt (2), the Gambia (4), Jordan (1), Pakistan (8), the Syrian Arab Republic (1) and the United Arab Emirates (9). Five cases were clarified on the basis of information provided by Governments and 24 on the basis of information provided by sources.

4. Between its 106th and 107th sessions, the Working Group, following its prompt intervention procedure, transmitted, jointly with other special procedure mechanisms, three communications, to Colombia, El Salvador and Mexico. The Working Group also transmitted a letter to Spain.

5. At its 107th session, the Working Group reviewed a general allegation concerning Pakistan.



III. Other activities

6. At its 107th session, the Working Group met with representatives from the Latin American and Caribbean Group, and held formal meetings with representatives of the Governments of Japan and Ukraine.

7. The Working Group also met with the Committee on Enforced Disappearances to exchange information on activities and to further cooperation and coordination on enforced disappearances. It also had a discussion with the president of the Abuelas de Plaza de Mayo organization and met with two experts of the Interdisciplinary Group of the Inter-American Commission on Human Rights on the case of the students of Ayotzinapa, Mexico.

8. The 107th session coincided with the thirtieth session of the Human Rights Council, during which the Working Group presented to the Council its annual report (A/HRC/30/38), its reports on its missions to the Western Balkans (A/HRC/30/38/Add.1, A/HRC/30/38/Add.2 and A/HRC/30/38/Add.3), its follow-up report to the recommendations made following its visits to Mexico and Timor-Leste (A/HRC/30/38/Add.4) and its study on enforced disappearances and economic, social and cultural rights (A/HRC/30/38/Add.5).

IV. Information concerning enforced or involuntary disappearances in States reviewed by the Working Group

Albania

Information from the Government

9. On 30 April 2015, the Government of Albania provided information on one outstanding case. The information provided was considered insufficient to lead to a clarification.

Algeria

Standard procedure

10. The Working Group transmitted 12 cases to the Government of Algeria, concerning:

(a) Mohamed Guellati, allegedly arrested at his workplace at the Centre Universitaire Larbi Ben M'hidi, Oum El Bouaghi Province, by the security services;

(b) Amar Gouadjlia, allegedly arrested by gendarmes in El Nakhla, Douar Ouled Abelakel, commune Ain M'lila, Oum El Bouaghi;

(c) Amar Haddad, allegedly arrested by agents of national security in Hama, Sétif;

(d) Djamel Ghomri, allegedly arrested on 10 December 1994 by police officers in Casbah, Algiers;

(e) Djamel Bouaïcha, allegedly abducted on 15 July 1995 in Aïn Lahdjar, commune de Fouka, Tipaza Province, by four plainclothed police officers;

(f) Adda Abdelhadi, allegedly arrested on 9 April 1995 by military and communal police officers in Mazouna, Relizane Province;

(g) Abderrahmane Allag, allegedly arrested on 25 October 1994 by police officers in uniform at Meftah, Blida Province;

(h) Yacine Kebche, allegedly arrested on 27 July 1995 by armed members of security services, at his workplace at the market of Daksi Abdessalem, Constantine Province;

(i) Mohamed Benbouziane, allegedly arrested on 8 January 1996 by military security agents at his shop in Chemin Larbi Ben M'hidi Remchi, Tlemcen Province;

(j) Mohamed Boualem, allegedly arrested on 19 November 1995 by military security agents, at his hairdressing salon in rue Oussama Fouklize, Oran Province;

(k) Ghali Boubkar, allegedly arrested on 19 November 1994 by armed security services agents at Ain El biya municipality, Oran Province;

(l) Seddik Bouchikhi, allegedly arrested by plain-clothed officers in front of the Court of Oran, and last seen in November 1994 at Magenta prison.

Argentina

Information from the Government

11. On 6 May 2015, the Government of Argentina transmitted information concerning two outstanding cases. The information provided was considered insufficient to lead to a clarification.

Information from sources

12. A source provided information on two outstanding cases. The information provided was considered insufficient to lead to a clarification.

Duplication

13. The Working Group decided to consider one case as a duplicate of an existing case. The duplicate was subsequently deleted from the Working Group's records.

Bahrain

Clarification

14. On the basis of the information provided by the source, the Working Group decided to clarify the case of Mohamed Sharaf. The individual has reportedly been in detention since April 2015.

Bangladesh

Urgent action

15. On 18 September 2015, the Working Group, following its urgent action procedure, transmitted one case to the Government of Bangladesh concerning Sajjad Hossain Sheikh, who was allegedly abducted on 21 August 2015 by members of the Rapid Action Battalion at the Dream Square Resort, Gazipur.

Standard procedure

16. The Working Group transmitted four cases to the Government, concerning:

(a) Nurul Amin, allegedly arrested in the courtyard of his home on 29 March 2015 by five policemen and four members of the Ansar auxiliary force;

(b) Shamim Uddin Prodhan, allegedly arrested in Bogra on 23 February 2015 by members of the Rapid Action Battalion;

(c) Nur Alam, allegedly arrested at the house of a person associated with him on 12 February 2015 by a group of plain-clothed men identifying themselves as members of a law enforcement agency;

(d) Sohel Rana, allegedly abducted in Dhaka on 10 February 2015 by State agents.

Prompt intervention letter

17. On 2 October 2015, the Working Group transmitted, jointly with three other special procedure mechanisms, a prompt intervention letter concerning alleged acts of harassment and intimidation against human rights defenders and relatives of victims of enforced disappearances, including the Asian Federation Against Involuntary Disappearances, the Asian Legal Resource Centre, the International Federation for Human Rights and Odhikar.

Observations

18. With regard to alleged acts of harassment and intimidation against human rights defenders, and relatives of victims of enforced disappearances, the Working Group recalls article 13, paragraph 3 of the Declaration, which states that “steps shall be taken to ensure that all involved in the investigation, including the complainant, counsel, witnesses and those conducting the investigation, are protected against ill-treatment, intimidation or reprisal”. Furthermore, the Working Group recalls Human Rights Council resolution 7/12, in which the Council urged States to take steps to provide adequate protection to witnesses of enforced or involuntary disappearances, human rights defenders acting against enforced disappearances and the lawyers and families of disappeared persons against any intimidation or ill-treatment to which they might be subjected.

Cambodia

Information from the Government

19. On 13 July 2015, the Government of Cambodia transmitted information concerning one outstanding case. The information provided was considered insufficient to lead to a clarification.

Information from sources

20. A source provided information on one outstanding case.

Central African Republic

Prompt intervention letter

21. On 2 September 2015, the Working Group transmitted, jointly with two other special procedure mechanisms, a prompt intervention letter concerning allegations of summary executions and torture committed by soldiers of the International Support Mission to the Central African Republic against members of the anti-Balaka militia in December 2013 and March 2014. Some seven other people are alleged to have been arrested during these incidents as a result of their alleged membership of the anti-Balaka militia and taken to the Mission base; their fate is unknown. A letter of allegation had been previously sent to the Government of the Congo (COG 1/2014), copied to the Government of the Central African Republic and to the African Union (OTH 9/2014), on 4 and 8 July 2014 respectively.

Chile

Information from the Government

22. On 19 May 2015, the Government of Chile transmitted information concerning three outstanding cases. On the basis of the information provided, the Working Group decided to apply the six-month rule to two cases. The information provided for the other case was considered insufficient to lead to a clarification.

China

Urgent action

23. On 30 July 2015, the Working Group, following its urgent action procedure, transmitted two cases to the Government of China concerning Dolkar Lhamo and Nyina Lhamo, allegedly arrested in Chengdu by the Litang Police on 17 July 2015.

24. On 3 August 2015, the Working Group, following its urgent action procedure, transmitted one cases to the Government concerning Li Heping, who was allegedly arrested in his apartment in Daxing District, Beijing on 10 July 2015.

Standard procedure

25. The Working Group transmitted nine cases to the Government of China, concerning:

(a) Kim Bun Sook, a national of the Democratic People's Republic of Korea, allegedly arrested by Chinese police on 27 October 2004 and repatriated to the Democratic People's Republic of Korea;

(b) Kim Hyung Il, a national of the Democratic People's Republic of Korea, allegedly arrested by Chinese police on 27 October 2004 and repatriated to the Democratic People's Republic of Korea;

(c) Kim Jung Ah, a national of the Democratic People's Republic of Korea, allegedly arrested on 29 May 2008 by the Shenyang security police in Shenyang and repatriated to the Democratic People's Republic of Korea in February 2009;

(d) Kim Chul Guk, a national of the Democratic People's Republic of Korea, allegedly arrested on 29 May 2008 by the Shenyang security police in Shenyang and repatriated to the Democratic People's Republic of Korea in February 2009;

(e) Kim Sung Ah, a national of the Democratic People's Republic of Korea, allegedly arrested on 29 May 2008 by the Shenyang security police in Shenyang and repatriated to the Democratic People's Republic of Korea in February 2009;

(f) Jung Nam Ok, a national of the Democratic People's Republic of Korea, allegedly arrested by Chinese police in Heilongjiang on 22 June 2007 and handed over to the Sinuiju Security Agency in the Democratic People's Republic of Korea;

(g) Jung Sun Kyung, a national of the Democratic People's Republic of Korea, allegedly arrested by Chinese police in Heilongjiang on 22 June 2007 and handed over to the Sinuiju Security Agency in the Democratic People's Republic of Korea;

(h) Ryu Hyuk, a national of the Democratic People's Republic of Korea, allegedly arrested by Chinese police in Heilongjiang on 22 June 2007 and handed over to the Sinuiju Security Agency in the Democratic People's Republic of Korea;

(i) Heo Chul Nam, a national of the Democratic People's Republic of Korea, allegedly arrested by Chinese police in Heilongjiang on 22 June 2007 and handed over to the Sinuiju Security Agency in the Democratic People's Republic of Korea.

26. In accordance with the methods of work of the Working Group, the Government of the Democratic People's Republic of Korea received a copy of the above nine cases.

Clarification

27. On 3 August 2015, a source provided information on two cases transmitted through the urgent action procedure on 30 July 2015. As a result, the Working Group decided to clarify the cases of Dolkar Lhamo and Nyina Lhamo.

28. On the basis of the information provided by the source, the Working Group also decided to clarify the previously transmitted case of Chongbiao Mi, who has reportedly been in detention since September 2013.

Information from the Government

29. On 30 April 2014, the Government transmitted information concerning four outstanding cases. The information provided was considered insufficient to lead to a clarification.

Colombia

Prompt intervention letter

30. On 25 June 2015, the Working Group transmitted, jointly with two other special procedure mechanisms, a prompt intervention letter concerning the alleged threats and attacks against witnesses in two cases of enforced disappearance and a lawyer, member of a human rights organization.

Congo

Prompt intervention letter

31. On 2 September 2015, the Working Group transmitted, jointly with two other special procedure mechanisms, a prompt intervention letter concerning allegations of summary executions and torture committed by soldiers of the International Support Mission to the Central African Republic against members of the anti-Balaka militia in December 2013 and March 2014 (see para. 21 above).

Democratic People's Republic of Korea

Standard procedure

32. The Working Group transmitted five cases to the Government of the Democratic People's Republic of Korea, concerning:

(a) A girl below 18 years of age, allegedly arrested by officers of the National Security Agency of the Democratic People's Republic of Korea on 17 February 2011;

(b) Ho Young Hee, allegedly arrested by officers of the National Security Agency of the Democratic People's Republic of Korea on 17 February 2011;

(c) A boy below 18 years of age, allegedly arrested by officers of the National Security Agency of the Democratic People's Republic of Korea on 17 February 2011;

(d) Kim Eun Shil, allegedly last seen in Sung Chun Defence Security Command in May 2009;

(e) Kim Seung-gil, allegedly arrested in June 2005 and last seen on 10 January 2006 at the Onsung County Security Agency located in Ontan-eup, Onsung-gun, North Hamkyung Province.

Information from the Government

33. On 22 July 2015, the Government transmitted information concerning 57 outstanding cases. The information provided was considered insufficient to lead to a clarification.

Democratic Republic of the Congo

Information from source

34. A source provided information on one outstanding case. The information provided was considered insufficient to lead to a clarification.

Ecuador

Information from the Government

35. On 31 August 2015, the Government of Ecuador transmitted information concerning one outstanding case. The information provided was considered insufficient to lead to a clarification.

Egypt

Urgent action

36. During the period under review, the Working Group transmitted 19 cases to the Government of Egypt under its urgent action procedure.

37. On 3 June 2015, the Working Group transmitted three cases to the Government under its urgent action procedure, concerning:

(a) Salah Attia Al Fiky, allegedly arrested at his home in Sakha, Kafr Al Sheikh on 22 April 2015 by members of the national security forces;

(b) Usama Salah Al Fiky, allegedly arrested at his home in Sakha, Kafr Al Sheikh on 22 April 2015 by members of the national security forces;

(c) Ahmed Sabr Mohamed Labib, allegedly arrested near Al Hosary roundabout on 27 April 2015 by national security forces.

38. On 23 June 2015, the Working Group transmitted six cases to the Government under its urgent action procedure, concerning:

(a) Mohamed Rashad Ibrahim Al Tonoby, allegedly arrested in Kafr Al Sheikh Province on 4 June 2015 by the State security police;

(b) Ahmed Mohamed Ahmed Mohamed, allegedly arrested at his home in Razna Village, Zakazik City, Sharkiya Province on 6 June 2015 by the police;

(c) Aly Mohamed Abdul Fattah, reportedly arrested by the State security police and allegedly last seen on 5 June 2015 at his home;

(d) Mosaad Al Sayed Aly Qotb, allegedly arrested at his home in Nasr City, Cairo with his son on 31 May 2015 by the State security police;

(e) Khalid Mosaad Al Sayed Qotb, allegedly arrested at his home in Nasr City, Cairo with his father on 31 May 2015 by the State security police;

(f) Israa Mahfouz Mohamed Al Taweel, allegedly arrested by police officers and last seen on 2 June 2015 in Maadi.

39. On 27 July 2015, the Working Group transmitted three cases to the Government under its urgent action procedure, concerning:

(a) Mohammed Gamal Mohammed Mohammed Shehata, allegedly arrested at Ramses train station in Cairo on 23 May 2015 by Homeland Security officers;

(b) Ammar Adel Zein el Ahebdeen Mohammed Mohammed Omar, allegedly arrested at his home in Ash Sharabeyah, Cairo Governorate on 28 May 2015 by Homeland Security officers;

(c) Ibrahim Motamid Amine Inani Al Jundi, allegedly arrested next to El Iman Mosque, Medinet Al Khosous, Giza Governorate on 8 May 2015 by Homeland Security officers.

40. On 21 August 2015, the Working Group transmitted one case to the Government under its urgent action procedure, concerning Mahmoud Tawfik Abdalaal, allegedly arrested at his home in Mahalla Al Kubra, Gharbia Governorate on 6 June 2015 by Homeland Security officers accompanied by members of the security forces.

41. On 30 August 2015, the Working Group transmitted three cases to the Government under its urgent action procedure, concerning:

(a) Mohammed Abdelaziz Farag, allegedly arrested at the family home in Shubra Al Kheima, Al Qalyubia Governorate on 23 August 2015 by Homeland Security officers;

(b) Abdelaziz Mohammed Abdelaziz Farag, allegedly arrested at his home in Shubra Al Kheima, Al Qalyubia Governorate on 23 August 2015 by Homeland Security officers;

(c) Ismael Abdelaziz Farag, allegedly arrested at his home in Shubra Al Kheima, Al Qalyubia Governorate on 23 August 2015 by Homeland Security officers.

42. On 4 September 2015, the Working Group transmitted two cases to the Government under its urgent action procedure, concerning:

(a) Abdelrahman Attef Hussein, allegedly arrested in a street near Matareyah Square in Cairo on 11 July 2015 by the Egyptian authorities;

(b) Hani Said Kahla, allegedly arrested in Shubra El Kheima on 19 August 2015 by the Egyptian authorities.

43. On 9 September 2015, the Working Group transmitted one case to the Government under its urgent action procedure concerning Mosab Abdallah Abdelhamid Morsy Hamed, allegedly arrested on 10 July 2015 at his home by plain-clothed officers thought to be from Homeland Security.

Clarification based on information from sources

44. On the basis of the information provided by the source, the Working Group decided to clarify the case of Israa Mahfouz Mohamed Al Taweel.

Information from the Government

45. During the period under review, the Government transmitted information concerning 26 outstanding cases. On the basis of the information provided, the Working Group decided to apply the six-month rule to 24 cases. The information provided on the other two cases was considered insufficient to lead to a clarification.

Clarification

46. On the basis of information previously provided by the Government, the Working Group decided to clarify the case of Ahmed Mossad El Maadawi Mohamed following the expiry of the period prescribed by the six-month rule (see A/HRC/WGEID/105/1, para. 47). The individual is reportedly in pretrial detention.

Observation

47. The Working Group thanks the Government for the large number of replies, which demonstrated the Government's commitment to engage with the Working Group and allowed it to potentially clarify a very high number of cases. It is, however, concerned that, during the period under review, it transmitted 19 reported cases of enforced disappearances under the urgent action procedure to the Government and that it continues to receive

allegations of cases of short-term disappearances. It reiterates that, as provided for in article 7 of the Declaration, no circumstances whatsoever may be invoked to justify enforced disappearances, and that, according to article 10 (2), accurate information on the detention of such persons and their place or places of detention, including transfers, should be made promptly available to their family members, their counsel or to any other persons having a legitimate interest in the information.

El Salvador

Information from the Government

48. On 3 August 2015, the Government of El Salvador transmitted information concerning three outstanding cases. The information provided was considered insufficient to lead to a clarification.

49. Also on 3 August 2015, the Government responded to a prompt intervention letter, transmitted on 12 May 2015, concerning alleged acts of intimidation of and harassment against relatives of Oscar Oswaldo Leiva Mejía, Francisco Javier Hernández Gómez and José Fernando Choto Choto, victims of enforced disappearance. In its reply, the State informed the Working Group that, according to information provided by the Attorney General's Office, an investigation had been launched into the alleged threats against the relatives. The State also provided further information on the investigation into the above-mentioned cases, currently under review by the Working Group.

50. On 2 September 2015, the Government replied to a general allegation sent by the Working Group, following its 105th session, regarding alleged obstacles encountered in the implementation of the Declaration. In its reply, the State informed the Working Group on the progress made in including enforced disappearance as a separate offence under criminal law; developing changes in the jurisprudential criteria of the Constitutional Chamber of the Supreme Court concerning enforced disappearances in the context of internal armed conflict; the application of procedural principles for the provision of evidence; and the activation of State mechanisms for the location and protection of missing persons, including through the national commission established to locate children who disappeared during the armed internal conflict.

Observations

51. The Working Group thanks the Government for its responses, and encourages it to continue its investigations into the alleged acts of intimidation of and harassment against relatives of victims of enforced disappearances, and to strengthen its efforts in the search and identification of disappeared persons.

Eritrea

Standard procedure

52. The Working Group transmitted five cases to the Government, concerning:

(a) Mahmoud Hassan Ibrahim Omer, alias Mahmoud Tassef, allegedly arrested on 18 February 1998 by internal security agents in the old City of Hagaz, province of Ansaba;

(b) Osman Ad Skaikh, allegedly arrested at his house by State security agents in September 2001, and last seen in March 2003 in the Asmara city prison;

(c) Mohamed Meranet, allegedly arrested by soldiers at his home on 17 July 1991, and last seen in Karsheli jail, Asmara, in 1997;

(d) Hamid Adem Mohammed Al Umran, allegedly arrested on 22 December 1991 by security forces in Adibra;

(e) Mussa Ibrahim Faragallah, allegedly abducted from his home on 4 March 1996 by Eritrean security forces.

France

Information from the Government

53. On 5 August 2015, the Government of France transmitted information concerning one outstanding case. The information provided was considered insufficient to lead to a clarification.

Gambia

Clarification based on information from sources

54. On the basis of the information provided by the source, the Working Group decided to clarify the cases of Yusupha Lowe, Corr Olimatou, Pa Alieu Lowe and Ebou Lowe. The four individuals were released in July 2015.

Information from the Government

55. On 17 June 2015, the Government of the United States of America transmitted information concerning two outstanding cases registered in the records of the Gambia. The information provided was considered insufficient to lead to a clarification.

Other information

56. The Working Group decided to transmit one case of Senegal to the Gambia.

Greece

Information from the Government

57. On 19 August 2015, the Government of Greece transmitted information concerning one outstanding case. The information provided was considered insufficient to lead to a clarification.

Iran (Islamic Republic of)

Information from the Government

58. On 28 August 2015, the Government of the Islamic Republic of Iran transmitted information concerning three outstanding cases. On the basis of the information provided, the Working Group decided to apply the six-month rule to one case. The information provided on the other two cases was considered insufficient to lead to a clarification.

Iraq

Urgent appeal

59. On 06 July 2015, the Working Group transmitted, jointly with two other special procedure mechanisms, an urgent appeal to the Government of Iraq concerning allegations of arbitrary arrest, detention and torture of Mohammed Abbas Kadhim al Sudani.

Italy

Other general information

60. On 2 June 2015, the Working Group transmitted a joint allegation letter concerning the alleged detention and torture of an Italian citizen of Moroccan origin, in the context of the secret detention, rendition and torture programme operated after 11 September 2001 by the Central Intelligence Agency of the United States of America. It was alleged that Abou Elkassim Britel was detained in Pakistan from March to May 2002 and subsequently

forcibly transferred to Morocco, with the alleged complicity of Italian authorities and the possible involvement of Portuguese authorities, on 24 May 2002. In 2003, Mr. Britel was sentenced to 15 years of imprisonment. On 14 April 2011, Mr. Britel was pardoned by the King of Morocco and released from prison. To date, no investigation has reportedly been initiated into the alleged events and no reparation or adequate psychological and medical rehabilitation has been provided to Mr. Britel or to his family members. A communication with the same content was addressed to the Governments of the Morocco, Pakistan, Portugal and the United States.

Information from the Government

61. On 5 August 2015 the Government of Italy responded to a letter sent on 2 June 2015 concerning the alleged detention and torture of Abou Elkassim Britel. In its reply, the State provided details on the follow-up to the case by the Italian authorities.

Jordan

Clarification

62. On the basis of the information provided by the source, the Working Group decided to clarify the case of Jaffer Al Shaikh Yousif.

Information from the Government

63. On 13 March 2015, the Government of Jordan transmitted information to the Working Group concerning the case of Jaffer Al Shaikh Yousif.

64. On 26 June 2015, the Government of Bahrain also transmitted information concerning the same outstanding case. The information provided was considered sufficient to lead to a clarification.

Kenya

Urgent action

65. On 29 July 2015, the Working Group, following its urgent action procedure, transmitted a case to the Government of Kenya concerning Jean Chrysostome Ntirugiribambe, who was allegedly abducted near the Tana shopping centre on Kamiti Road, in Nairobi on 23 June 2015 by three armed men. In accordance with the methods of work of the Working Group, the Government of Rwanda also received a copy of the case.

Standard procedure

66. The Working Group transmitted five cases to the Government, concerning:

(a) Andrew Kipchoge Kibok, allegedly arrested on 8 April 2008 by officers of the Kenyan army in Mt. Elgon Rorest;

(b) Stephen Kones Kipsobo, allegedly arrested on 8 April 2008 by military officers of the 20th battalion of the Kenyan Army in Chelebei village, Chongeywo, Kopsiro Division, Mt. Elgon;

(c) Elijah Nyokia, allegedly arrested on 3 April 2008 by military officers of the 20th battalion of the Kenya Army at Chelebei Market, Chongeywo, Kopsiro Division, Mt. Elgon;

(d) Bernard Kimnyeshia Tutei, allegedly last seen on 2 April 2008 at the Kapkota military camp;

(e) Sylvanus Kanaka Bernard, allegedly arrested on 4 April 2008 at his home in Chelebei Village, Chongeywo, Mt. Elgon, by military officers of the 20th battalion of the Kenyan army.

Libya

Standard procedure

67. The Working Group transmitted one case to the Government of Libya, concerning Abdelnaser Elgoroshi, allegedly abducted on 20 October 2014 by an armed group at a checkpoint adjacent to the Arab Medical University in Belaon, Benghazi.

Mexico

Standard procedure

68. The Working Group transmitted four cases to the Government of Mexico, concerning:

(a) Pedro Angel Márquez Mendoza, allegedly abducted on 4 June 2014 by federal police, navy and State police agents in Orizaba, Veracruz;

(b) Erick Guillermo Zendejas Campano, allegedly arrested on 16 January 2011 by transit police officers in Guadalupe, Nuevo León, Monterrey;

(c) Diego Armando Flores Acevedo, allegedly abducted in Monterrey, Nuevo León on 22 July 2010 by agents of the State investigation agency (Policía Ministerial);

(d) Ramiro Ruiz Raya, allegedly last seen on 20 July 2014 in a prison of the Public Security Agency (Policía Preventiva) in Sombrerete, Zacatecas.

Prompt intervention letter

69. On 10 July 2015, the Working Group transmitted, jointly with other three special procedure mechanisms, a prompt intervention letter concerning the alleged arbitrary detention of 12 individuals charged in connection to the case of the Ayotzinapa students, and allegations of their torture and ill-treatment.

Press release

70. On 9 September 2015, the Working Group issued, jointly with other two special procedure mechanisms, a press release in which it welcomed the report of the Interdisciplinary Group of Independent Experts of the Inter-American Commission on Human Rights on the enforced disappearance, execution and torture of students from Ayotzinapa in the State of Guerrero in September 2014, and encouraged the Government of Mexico to implement all of its recommendations. The experts stressed that the recommendations of the Interdisciplinary Group were relevant not only to this case, but also to the challenges facing Mexico with regard to cases of enforced disappearances, torture and executions in general. They reiterated their offer of cooperation and technical assistance to the State of Mexico.

Information from the Government

71. On 30 April and on 12 May 2015, the Government of Mexico responded to a prompt intervention letter transmitted on 25 February 2015 concerning the alleged acts of arbitrary detention, torture and restriction of the right to defence of Sidronio Casarrubias Salgado. In its reply, the Government stated that Mr. Casarrubias Salgado had been arrested, in accordance with article 16 of the Constitution, for possession of weapons in a public place by the Ministerial Police. Mr. Casarrubias Salgado was subsequently accused of organized crime and possession of weapons, for which criminal proceedings were initiated against him and other individuals. The Government also stated that the acts of torture alleged were being investigated by the Federal Public Ministry and the National Commission of Human Rights.

Information from sources

72. Sources provided information on five outstanding cases.

Observations

73. The Working Group express its concern that, in some cases, the crime of enforced disappearance is not applied retroactively. In this regard, the Working Group recalls its general comment No. 9, on enforced disappearance as a continuous crime, in which it stated that one consequence of the continuing character of enforced disappearance is that it is possible to convict someone for enforced disappearance on the basis of a legal instrument that was enacted after the enforced disappearance began, notwithstanding the fundamental principle of non-retroactivity. The crime cannot be separated and the conviction should cover the enforced disappearance as a whole (see A/HRC/16/48, para. 39). As stated in its follow-up report on its visit to Mexico (A/HRC/30/38/Add.4), the Working Group hopes that the future general law on enforced disappearance will include a national definition consistent with the relevant international instruments.

Morocco**Standard procedure**

74. The Working Group transmitted five cases to the Government, concerning:

(a) Mohamed “Lachheb” Sajid, allegedly abducted in April 1963 by plain-clothed police officers in Bouchentouf, Casablanca;

(b) Mohamed Nechabi, allegedly arrested on 11 June 1973 at his home in Aït-Khouya Tghat, Khenifra by a commando comprising members of the Royal Armed Forces, gendarmes and auxiliary forces;

(c) Moha Oukka Arsali, allegedly arrested on 11 June 1973 at his home in Aït-Khouya Tghat, Khenifra by a commando comprising members of the Royal Armed Forces, gendarmes and auxiliary forces;

(d) Abdessalam Harrafi, allegedly arrested on 1 May 1972 by plain-clothed policemen near the headquarters of the Royal Armed Forces in Casablanca;

(e) Mohammed Ben Hammou El Hadj Errahoune, allegedly arrested on 15 May 1961 by plain-clothed policemen in Nador.

Observations

75. The Working Group sincerely thanks the Government of Morocco for its invitation to organize its next session from 8 to 12 February 2016 in Rabat.

Other general information

76. On 2 June 2015, the Working Group transmitted a joint allegation letter concerning the alleged detention and torture of an Italian citizen of Moroccan origin, in the context of the secret detention, rendition and torture programme operated after 11 September 2001 by the Central Intelligence Agency of the United States of America (see para. 60 above).

Pakistan**Urgent action**

77. During the period under review, the Working Group transmitted, under its urgent action procedure, 39 cases to the Government of Pakistan.

78. On 15 June 2015, the Working Group transmitted 24 cases under its urgent action procedure, concerning:

(a) Asim Ahmed Khan Arif Khan, allegedly arrested at his work place on 30 April 2015 by Pakistani Rangers;

(b) Muhammad Ghayas Ahmed Muhammad Muhammad Shabir Ahmed, allegedly arrested at his home on 30 April 2015 by Pakistani Rangers;

(c) Sanuallah Sadaruddin, allegedly arrested at his home on 30 April 2015 by Pakistani Rangers;

(d) Muhammad Saeed Dawood Muhammad Dawood Khan, allegedly arrested at his home on 30 April 2015 by Pakistani Rangers;

(e) Muhammad Shafiq Muhammad Rafiq allegedly arrested at his home on 30 April 2015 by Pakistani Rangers;

(f) Zubair Muhammad Iqbal Ghori, allegedly arrested at his home on 29 April 2015 by Pakistani Rangers;

(g) Muhammad Asif Muhammad Deen, allegedly arrested at his home on 29 April 2015 by Pakistani Rangers;

(h) Qasimullah Naeem Ullah, allegedly arrested at his home on 28 April 2015 by Pakistani Rangers;

(i) Yasir Muhammad Wasi, allegedly arrested at his home on 28 April 2015 by Pakistani Rangers;

(j) Shahid Ali Khan Ahmed Ali Khan allegedly arrested at his home on 28 April 2015 by Pakistani Rangers;

(k) Muhammad Atif Ali Nazar Muhammad, allegedly arrested at his home on 28 April 2015 by Pakistani Rangers;

(l) Muhammad Arif Muhammad Fareed, allegedly arrested at his home on 20 April 2015 by Pakistani Rangers;

(m) Murad Hussain Abdul Ghafoor, allegedly arrested at his home on 16 April 2015 by Pakistani Rangers;

(n) Shamsuddin Riyazuddin, allegedly arrested while returning from work on 13 April 2015 by Pakistani Rangers;

(o) Muhammad Adeel Muhammad Shareef, allegedly arrested while returning from work on 1 April 2015 by Pakistani Rangers;

(p) Adnan Khan Muhammad, allegedly arrested near his work place on 30 March 2015 by law enforcement agencies at Korangi crossing in Karachi;

(q) Mr. Azizuddin, allegedly arrested at his home on 30 March 2015 by Pakistani Rangers;

(r) Sultan Mehmood Khan, allegedly arrested at Flat No. 406, Mariya square, Shadman Town, Karachi on 29 March 2015 by Pakistani Rangers;

(s) Majid Muhammad, allegedly arrested at his home on 27 March 2015 by masked Pakistani Rangers;

(t) Zubair Sultan Gaddi, allegedly arrested at his home on 26 March 2015 by masked Pakistani Rangers;

(u) Shamshad Ali Nil, allegedly arrested at a barber shop in Sector-9, Baldia Town, Karachi on 24 March 2015 by Pakistani Rangers;

(v) Ali Raza Muhammad, allegedly arrested at his home on 19 March 2015 by Pakistani Rangers, some plain-clothed;

(w) Majeed Nadeem Molana Abdul, allegedly arrested in Orangi Town, Karachi on 18 March 2015 by Pakistani Rangers;

(x) Muhammad Rizwan Shani Khan, allegedly arrested on 18 March 2015 by Pakistani Rangers and last seen near his friend's home in Behar Colony, Karachi;

79. On 23 June 2015, the Working Group transmitted five cases under its urgent action procedure, concerning:

(a) Ghayyas Ahmed Khan, allegedly arrested at the Vehari Hotel, Karachi on 30 April 2015 by Pakistani Rangers;

(b) Imran Ali Akhtar Ali, allegedly arrested at his home on 28 April 2015 by Pakistani Rangers;

(c) Muhammad Altaf Hussain Muhammad Bashir, allegedly arrested at his home on 7 April 2015 by Pakistani Rangers, some plain-clothed;

(d) Shariq Kamal, allegedly arrested at his work place on 30 March 2015 by Pakistani Rangers;

(e) Jawaid Muhajir Muhammad, allegedly arrested near the GPO Office, Karachi South, on 27 March 2015 by Pakistani Rangers, some plain-clothed.

80. On 14 July 2015, the Working Group transmitted 10 cases under its urgent action procedure, concerning:

(a) Hassan Dilawar Khan, allegedly arrested at the Nadra Office, Landhi Town, Karachi East on 25 May 2015 by Pakistani Rangers, some plain-clothed;

(b) Muhammad Adnan Yousuf Zai, allegedly arrested while returning from work at Neti Jetty Bridge, Karachi, on 20 May 2015 by law enforcement officials;

(c) Riaz-ul-Haq Muhammad, allegedly arrested at No. 6, Gali No. 9, Area 4-D, Landhi, No. 6, Karachi East on 19 May 2015 by Pakistani Rangers;

(d) Adil Zia Muhammad, allegedly arrested at his office located at Port Qasim, Malir, Karachi on 10 May 2015 by the police and Pakistani Rangers, some plain-clothed;

(e) Sher Ali Farooqui, allegedly arrested at Attara Chowrangi, near Dawood Public School, Bahadurabad, Karachi East, on 7 May 2015 by plain-clothed law enforcement officials;

(f) Faryal Baig, allegedly arrested at his home on 7 May 2015 by police and law enforcement agencies officials, some plain-clothed;

(g) Muhammad Hashim Rajput, allegedly arrested while returning home, near Dakkhana, Karachi Central on 6 May 2015 by law enforcement agencies;

(h) Muhammad Furqan Khan, allegedly arrested at a snooker club in Nagan Chowrangi, North Karachi Central on 6 May 2015 by Pakistani Rangers;

(i) Muhammad Asim Syed, allegedly arrested at his home on 29 April 2015 by Pakistani Rangers, some plain-clothed;

(j) Atif Ali Hashmi allegedly arrested at a wedding on 16 April 2015 by Pakistani Rangers, some plain-clothed.

Standard procedure

81. The Working Group transmitted 12 cases to the Government, concerning:

(a) Ahmed Abrar, allegedly abducted at his tea hotel located at Orangi Town No. 10, Karachi on 21 January by masked Pakistani Rangers in uniform;

(b) Khan Arif, allegedly arrested at Usman Shaheed Park, Landhi, No. 4, Karachi East on 20 April 2015 by Pakistani Rangers;

(c) Imran Mehtab Imran Mehtab, allegedly abducted in front of the PERA Pan Shop, Sector 5/C-2, North Karachi on 27 February 2015 by Pakistani Rangers in uniform;

(d) Khan Jahangir Babu, allegedly abducted from a bus stop located at Baloch Colony Bridge, Shahrah-e-Faisal, Karachi on 5 March 2015 by plain-clothed law enforcement officials;

(e) Muhammad Kashif, allegedly abducted on 24 February 2015 by law enforcement officials;

(f) Khan Nadeem Ahmed, allegedly abducted from his home on 24 February 2015 by Pakistani Rangers;

(g) Syed Naveed Ahmed, allegedly abducted outside his home on 31 January 2015 by the Pakistani Rangers;

(h) Syed Zeeshan Hussain, allegedly abducted in front of a pan shop at Dak Khana Chowrangi, Karachi on 15 September 2013 by plain-clothed law enforcement officials;

(i) Syed Tanveer Ahmed, allegedly abducted from his home on 13 January 2015 by Pakistani Rangers;

(j) Khan Waseem, allegedly abducted from his temporary residence in Karachi on 6 February 2015 by Pakistani Rangers;

(k) Syed Tahir Ali, allegedly abducted near his home on 6 January 2015 by Pakistani Rangers;

(l) Khan Shehzad, allegedly abducted near his home on 16 January 2015 by Pakistani Rangers.

Information from the Government

82. On 6 May and 29 July 2015, the Government of Pakistan transmitted information concerning 49 outstanding cases. On the basis of the information provided, the Working Group decided to apply the six-month rule to 14 cases. The information provided on the other 35 cases was considered insufficient to lead to a clarification.

Information from sources

83. Sources provided information on five outstanding cases. The information provided was considered insufficient to lead to a clarification.

Clarification based on information from sources

84. On the basis of information provided by sources, the Working Group decided to clarify the cases of Muhammad Tahir Rehan Muhammad Anwar, Zubair Muhammad Iqbal, Adnan Khan Muhammad, Zubair Sultan Gaddi, Ghayyas Ahmed Khan, Muhammad Adnan Yousuf Zai, Sher Ali Farooqui and Muhammad Hashim Rajput. Three individuals are reportedly free, three are in custody and two were found dead.

Prompt intervention letter

85. On 28 August 2015, the Working Group transmitted, jointly with other two special procedure mechanisms, a prompt intervention letter concerning the alleged enforced disappearance of Zeenat Shezadi, a social worker and investigative journalist, in reprisal for her work on enforced disappearances.

Observations

86. The Working Group is concerned that, during the period under review, it transmitted to the Government under its urgent action procedure 39 newly reported cases of enforced disappearances. In this regard, the Working Group stresses that, as provided for in article 7 of the Declaration, no circumstances whatsoever may be invoked to justify enforced disappearances, and that, according to article 10 (2), accurate information on the detention of such persons and their place or places of detention, including transfers, should be made promptly available to their family members, their counsel or to any other persons having a legitimate interest in the information.

Other general information

87. On 2 June 2015, the Working Group transmitted a joint allegation letter concerning the alleged detention and torture of an Italian citizen of Moroccan origin, in the context of the secret detention, rendition and torture programme operated after 11 September 2001 by the Central Intelligence Agency of the United States of America (see para. 60).

Peru**Information from the Government**

88. On 27 August 2015, the Government of Peru transmitted information to the Working Group concerning two outstanding cases. The information provided was considered insufficient to lead to a clarification.

Information from sources

89. A source provided information on one outstanding case. The information provided was considered insufficient to lead to a clarification.

Other general information

90. The Working Group visited Peru from 1 to 10 June 2015, at the invitation of the Government. The Working Group will present a report on its mission to the Human Rights Council at its thirty-third session.

Philippines**Information from the Government**

91. On 30 April 2015, the Government of the Philippines transmitted information to the Working Group concerning two outstanding cases. The information provided was considered insufficient to lead to a clarification.

Portugal**Other general information**

92. On 2 June 2015, the Working Group transmitted a joint allegation letter concerning the alleged detention and torture of an Italian citizen of Moroccan origin, in the context of the secret detention, rendition and torture programme operated by the U.S. Central Intelligence Agency after 11 September 2001 (see para. 60 above).

Spain

Information from the Government

93. On 5 August 2015, the Government of Spain responded to a letter transmitted on 7 January 2015 concerning allegations of the possible closure, owing to a lack of funding, of a laboratory in Ponferrada, the services of which are used to exhume the remains of victims found in mass graves left by the civil war. In its reply, the Government provided information regarding subsidies offered between 2006 and 2011 for projects related to the said exhumations. The Government also reported that, while current economic austerity measures had impeded the further allocation of such subsidies, existing legislation did not preclude the Government from subsidizing such projects again once the financial situation had improved.

Observations

94. The Working Group encourages the Government of Spain to strengthen its efforts in the search and identification of disappeared persons.

Sudan

95. On 18 September 2015, the Working Group, following its urgent action procedure, transmitted a case to the Government of the Sudan concerning Babacar Moussa Issa, allegedly arrested in Khartoum on 27 August 2015 by members of the National Intelligence and Security Services.

Syrian Arab Republic

Urgent action

96. On 18 September 2015, the Working Group, following its urgent action procedure, transmitted one case to the Government of the Syrian Arab Republic concerning Fadi Edlbi, allegedly last seen in June 2015 on the premises of the 40th “anti-terrorism branch in Jesr Abyad district, Damascus.

Standard procedure

97. The Working Group transmitted 24 cases to the Government, concerning:

(a) Safa’a Lala, allegedly abducted on 7 March 2013 at a checkpoint in Aalmidan neighborhood;

(b) Mohammed Noor Zada, allegedly arrested at his home in Homs on 31 December 2012 by military forces;

(c) Ahmed Al-Zaidan, allegedly arrested at the Masnaa border crossing between the Syrian Arab Republic and Lebanon on 27 September 2012 by plain-clothed members of Military Security;

(d) Hassan Saeed, allegedly arrested at a checkpoint near the Al Nakhla roundabout, Al Inshaat District, Homs on 29 August 2012 by members of the army and Military Intelligence;

(e) Imad Al Droubi, allegedly arrested at the Al Mahatta checkpoint for new passports in Homs on 22 May 2013 by Military Security officials in Homs;

(f) Abdullatif Sabbagh, allegedly arrested at the military checkpoint in Jabal Al Zaweya, Idlib province, on 1 August 2012 by members of the Syrian army;

(g) Ali Kharouf, allegedly arrested while crossing the military checkpoint near the village of Al Lataminah on 26 May 2013 by Air Intelligence officials;

- (h) Hayan Al Deib, allegedly arrested on 15 August 2012 by a Syrian army patrol in the village of Zour Al Haysa, near Al Lataminah, Hama governorate;
- (i) Mohamad Amir Mashki, allegedly last seen in April 2014 at the Al Khatib State Security Branch in Baghdad Street, Damascus;
- (j) Abdul Razak Mubarak, allegedly last seen on 1 October 2012 in Branch No. 215 of the Military Intelligence in Damascus;
- (k) Ahmad Saleh, allegedly arrested at a checkpoint in Latakia on 6 December 2012 by plain-clothed State security officials;
- (l) Alaa Ali Dib, allegedly arrested in Eight March Street in Latakia on 18 August 2012 by the military security forces;
- (m) Radwan Al-Hilawe, allegedly arrested at his home on 15 August 2012 by a Syrian army patrol;
- (n) Ammar Qadour, allegedly arrested in Betfeil village, Latakia on 11 August 2011 by members of the political security forces, State security and the armed forces;
- (o) Hassan Al Bakour, allegedly arrested in Al Lataminah on 15 April by a patrol comprising members of the Syrian army and Air Force Intelligence;
- (p) Mohammad Al-Qaiyem, allegedly arrested at Al Mazra'a checkpoint in Al Wa'er, Homs in August 2013 by military security National Defence officials;
- (q) Oula Basheer, allegedly abducted near Damascus main hospital, Al-Mujtahed, on 16 September 2013 by individuals thought to be military force officials;
- (r) Nasrallah Al Moazzin, allegedly abducted between the checkpoints of Kafrayya and Al-Fu'ah in the Idlib countryside on 25 May 2013 by Air Force Intelligence;
- (s) Hossam Ajoj, allegedly last seen at Branch No. 215 of the Department of Military Intelligence in Damascus on 30 November 2014;
- (t) Moatz Mohammed Al Bitar, allegedly arrested at his home on 30 May 2013 by Political Security officials;
- (u) Mustafa Al Bitar, allegedly arrested at Al Mahrouqa checkpoint, Tripoli road, Homs on 9 March 2012;
- (v) El Khattab Mujahid, allegedly arrested at Al Mahrouqa checkpoint, between Tabyat Al Imam and Al Lataminah, Hama Governorate on 30 April 2012;
- (w) Abdel Muti Ibrahim, allegedly last seen on 15 July 2012 at the Military Security office in Idlib;
- (x) Mohammad Raja'ie Khalou, allegedly arrested in front of As-Salam Hospital, Al-Qameshli city, on 25 June 2008 by an Air Force Intelligence patrol.

Clarification based on information from sources

98. On the basis of information provided by sources, the Working Group decided to clarify the case of Al Sirafi Ayham. The individual is reportedly in detention.

Information from sources

99. Sources provided information on two outstanding cases.

Information from the Government

100. On 9 July 2015, the Government transmitted information concerning five outstanding cases. The information provided was considered insufficient to lead to a clarification.

Observation

101. The Working Group continues to be concerned about the situation in the Syrian Arab Republic, which may facilitate enforced disappearances by State and increasingly by non-State actors. It reiterates article 7 of the Declaration, which states that no circumstances whatsoever may be invoked to justify enforced disappearances.

Tajikistan

Information from the Government

102. On 11 May 2015, the Government transmitted information to the Working Group concerning one outstanding case. The information provided was considered insufficient to lead to a clarification.

Tunisia

Information from sources

103. Sources provided information on one outstanding case.

Information from the Government

104. On 1 June 2015, the Government of Tunisia transmitted information concerning two outstanding cases. The information provided was considered insufficient to lead to a clarification.

Turkey

Information from the Government

105. On 28 August 2015, the Government of Turkey transmitted information concerning 41 outstanding cases. On the basis of the information provided, the Working Group decided to apply the six-month rule to one case. The information provided on the other 40 cases was considered insufficient to lead to a clarification.

Ukraine

Standard procedure

106. The Working Group transmitted one case to the Government of Ukraine, concerning Vladimir Alekseevich Bezobrazov, a Russian national allegedly abducted in front of the Ovidiopol District Court, Odessa on 6 March 2015 by State Security Service officials.

107. In accordance with the methods of work of the Working Group, the Government of the Russian Federation received a copy of the above-mentioned case.

Information from the Government

108. On 13 January 2015 the Government of Ukraine transmitted a reply to an urgent appeal transmitted on 4 December 2014, concerning the alleged arbitrary arrest and disappearance of Aleksander Minchenok. In its reply, the State provided information regarding the pretrial investigation currently under way.

Observations

109. The Working Group is concerned about the deteriorating situation in Ukraine, which may facilitate cases of enforced disappearance. It reiterates article 7 of the Declaration, which states that no circumstances whatsoever, whether a threat of war, a state of war, internal political instability or any other public emergency, may be invoked to justify enforced disappearances.

United Arab Emirates**Urgent action**

110. On 20 August 2015, the Working Group, following its urgent action procedure, transmitted one case to the Government of the United Arab Emirates concerning Dr. Nasser bin Ghaith, allegedly arrested while leaving his office in Abu Dhabi on 18 August 2015 by State Security officials.

Clarification based on information from sources

111. On the basis of information provided by sources, the Working Group decided to clarify the cases of Youssouf Abd Al Ghani Ali Al Hamadi, Al Yazyeh Khalifa Al Suwaidi, Meriem Khalifa Al Suwaidi, Asma Khalifa Al Suwaidi and Hamed Ali Mohamed Ali Al Hamadi. Four individuals are reportedly free, while the other one is reportedly in detention.

Information from the Government

112. On 3 March and 23 April 2015, the Government of the United Arab Emirates transmitted information regarding three outstanding cases. The information provided was considered insufficient to lead to a clarification. On the basis of information provided by sources, however, the Working Group decided to consider the cases clarified.

Clarification

113. On the basis of information provided by the Government, the Working Group, following the expiration of the period prescribed by the six-month rule (see A/HRC/WGEID/105/1, para. 150), decided to clarify the cases of Saud Kulaib Al Tenaiji, Abdulwahed Hassan Al Badi Al Shuhi, Mohamed Salim Rashid Majid Alzamar Al Ali and Ahmed Mohamed Abderrahmane Al-Moulla. The four individuals are reportedly in detention.

United States of America**Other general information**

114. On 2 June 2015, the Working Group transmitted a joint Allegation Letter concerning the alleged detention and torture of an Italian citizen of Moroccan origin, in the context of the secret detention, rendition and torture programme operated by the U.S. Central Intelligence Agency after 11 September 2001 (see para. 60 above).

Uzbekistan

Information from the Government

115. On 28 April 2015, the Government of Uzbekistan transmitted information concerning seven outstanding cases. The information provided was considered insufficient to lead to a clarification.

Yemen

Information from the Government

116. On 24 August 2015, the Government of the United States of America transmitted information regarding one outstanding case. The information provided was considered insufficient to lead to a clarification.

Zimbabwe

Information from the Government

117. On 26 May 2015, the Government of Zimbabwe transmitted information regarding one outstanding case. The information provided was considered insufficient to lead to a clarification.

Information from sources

118. A source provided information on one outstanding case.

Other bodies

African Union

Prompt intervention letter

119. On 2 September 2015, the Working Group transmitted, jointly with two other special procedure mechanisms, a prompt intervention letter concerning allegations of summary executions and torture committed by soldiers of the International Support Mission to the Central African Republic against members of the anti-Balaka militia in December 2013 and March 2014 (see para. 21).
